EVALUATING THE OUTCOMES OF DEVELOPMENT PLAN WITH SPECIAL REFERENCE TO MORATUWA DEVELOPMENT PLAN

Thotamuna Kankanamge Gayani Prasadika Ranasinghe

(108509H)

Department of Buidling Economics

University of Moratuwa
Sri Lanka

February 2013
EVALUATING THE OUTCOMES OF DEVELOPMENT PLAN WITH SPECIAL REFERENCE TO MORATUWA DEVELOPMENT PLAN

Thotamuna Kankanamge Gayani Prasadika Ranasinghe

(108509H)

University of Moratuwa, Sri Lanka. Electronic Theses & Dissertations www.lib.mrt.ac.lk

Dissertation submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirement for the Master of Science in Project Management

Department of Building Economics

University of Moratuwa

Sri Lanka

February 2013
DECLARATION

I declare that this is my own work and this dissertation does not incorporate without acknowledgement any material previously submitted for a Degree or Diploma in any other University or institute of higher learning and to the best of my knowledge and belief it does not contain any material previously published or written by another person except where the acknowledgement is made in the text.

Also, I hereby grant to University of Moratuwa the non-exclusive right to reproduce and distribute my dissertation, in whole or in part in print, electronic or other medium. I retain the right to use this content in whole or part in future works (such as articles or books)

................................................................. .................................................................
Ranasinghe, T.K.G.P.  Date

University of Moratuwa, Sri Lanka. Electronic Theses & Dissertations www.lib.mrt.ac.lk

The above candidate has carried out research for the Masters dissertation under my supervision.

................................................................. .................................................................
Prof.(Archt). Lalith de Silva Date

Dissertation Supervisor
Plan outcome evaluation (POE) is very significant rather than focusing on planning process, usefulness of plan, content and quality of plan. POE has been ignored in the field of planning due to lack of proper POE method. Therefore planners cannot identify whether or why plans achieve their objectives, or learn from the results of past interventions to improve planning practice. This study focuses on the ex post facto evaluation considering the outcomes of action projects of development plan and aim to develop a POE method to evaluate outcomes of development plan towards the achievement of its objectives quantitatively since no one has made such an attempt. A comprehensive literature survey revealed that adaptation of the components of objective driven, theory-driven and theory-based, utilization-driven and theoretical data-driven evaluation methods will lead to overcome related issues on plan outcome evaluation. Basic four steps suitable to incorporate in any POE method were identified by referring POE methodologies developed by Mayne (2001) and Laurian et al,(2004,2010).

This developed POE method includes four steps comprising objective achievement matrix and relevant mathematical models. Field surveys and questionnaire surveys were carried out to identify public perception on achievement of outcomes of action projects. Developed POE method can be used as a progress monitoring tool and also as an outcome evaluation tool since it is sensitive to evaluate the outcomes of ongoing projects as well. Results of the evaluation of outcome of six action projects under Moratuwa development plan indicated that, outcomes of all three implemented action projects have been contributed to achieve relevant criteria of objectives in moderate level by indicating CAV values between 41% to 65%. Other partly implemented three action projects have been contributed to achieve related criteria of objectives in low level by indicating CAV values in between 18% to 40%. This POE method will be a useful tool to planners, project managers, and policy makers to improve planning practices and to provide the necessary knowledge to revise plans, improve performance of the projects. This study can be extended to evaluate the outcomes of development plan when objectives are clear and measurable further considering theory, process and objectives driven methods in depth.

**Keywords:** POE method, public perception, outcomes of development plan
I dedicate this dissertation to my Loving parents and teachers...
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This research study would not have been a success without the assistance, encouragement and dedication of numerous individuals and organizations who contributed in numerous ways. Therefore I take this opportunity to convey my gratitude to all of them.

First and foremost, I would be grateful to my principle supervisor, Senior lecturer, Prof. Lalith de Silva for his excellent supervision. His commitment and dedication towards this study contributed to the successful completion of this research.

I would like to express my sincere thanks to the Head of the Department, Mr. Indunil Seneviratne, Dissertation Coordinator Dr. Y.G. Sandanayake, Mr Suranga Jayasena other lecturers and all other academic and non academic staff members of the Department of Building Economics for their enormous guidance and assistance to make this study a success.

Then my sincere gratitude goes Prof. Emeritus K.R.M.T. Karunarathne for his excellent advices pertaining to the analysis stage of this study.

I would also like to thank all the planning officers of Moratuwa Municipal Council, project officers of each action project and community of Moratuwa MC Area, who contributed with kind response to questionnaires issued, in spite of their busy working schedules.

Finally, I express my heartfelt thanks for my colleagues and many others who contributed in numerous ways to make this dissertation a success.

Ranasinghe, T.K.G.P.
30th January 2013
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

Declaration ................................................................................................................................................... I
Abstract ..................................................................................................................................................... II
Dedication ................................................................................................................................................ III
Acknowledgments .................................................................................................................................... IV
Table of contents .................................................................................................................................. V
List of figures ........................................................................................................................................ VIII
List of tables .......................................................................................................................................... IX
List of abbreviations ............................................................................................................................. X

## CHAPTER 1 ......................................................................................................................................... 1

### INTRODUCTION ......................................................................................................................... 1

1.1 Background....................................................................................................................................... 1
1.2 Problem Statement........................................................................................................................... 3
1.3 Aim and Objectives ........................................................................................................................ 3
1.4 Methodology................................................................................................................................... 4
1.5 Scope and Limitation....................................................................................................................... 5
1.6 Structure of the Report .................................................................................................................... 5

## CHAPTER 2 ......................................................................................................................................... 7

### LITERATURE REVIEW ................................................................................................................ 7

2.1 Introduction ...................................................................................................................................... 7
2.2 Levels of Planning.......................................................................................................................... 7
2.3 Local Development Plan ............................................................................................................... 10
2.4 The Importance of Planning Evaluation ....................................................................................... 10
2.5 Progress towards the Plan Outcome Evaluation ........................................................................... 13
2.6 Types of Outcome Evaluation ....................................................................................................... 14
  2.6.1 Goal or objective driven evaluation ....................................................................................... 15
  2.6.2 Theory-driven and theory-based evaluation ........................................................................... 15
  2.6.3 Utilization-driven evaluation ................................................................................................ 16
  2.6.4 Theoretical data-driven evaluation ....................................................................................... 17
2.7 Barriers for Evaluating Plan Outcomes ..............................................................17
2.8 Different POE Methodologies ............................................................................19
  2.8.1 A POE methodology by Mayne (2001) ...................................................19
  2.8.2 A POE methodology by Laurian et al,(2004,2010) ................................. 22
  2.8.3 The problems associated with these POE methodologies.................23
2.9 Proposals to overcome the Issues on POE methods ........................................25
  2.9.1 Identify the relationship between objectives and outcomes.............25
  2.9.2 Involving proper stakeholder in the process of POE methodology ....26
2.10 Findings of Literature Review ........................................................................30
2.11 Summary ............................................................................................................37

CHAPTER 3 ............................................................................................................. 38
  RESEARCH METHODOLOGY ................................................................................. 38
  3.1 Introduction ......................................................................................................38
  3.2 Research Design .............................................................................................38
  3.3 Phase One ......................................................................................................39
  3.4 Phase Two ......................................................................................................41
  3.5 Phase Three ..................................................................................................42
    3.5.1 Public perception .................................................................................. 43
    3.5.2 Study on selected development plan ................................................. 43
    3.5.3 Objective achievement matrix ......................................................... 44
    3.5.4 Field survey and questionnaire survey .......................................... 44
      3.5.4.1 Justification for survey approach ........................................ 44
      3.5.4.2 Sample selection ................................................................... 45
    3.5.5 Developing a POE Method ................................................................. 46
  3.6 Summary ........................................................................................................ 50

CHAPTER 4 ............................................................................................................. 51
  APPLICATION OF POE METHOD ......................................................................... 51
  4.1 Introduction .....................................................................................................51
  4.2 Step One - Identify the logical sequence and coherence of plan elements......51
  4.3 Step Two–Identify the associations between objectives and outcomes .......54
LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 2.1: Conceptual framework for local planning and implementation ............. 9
Figure 2.1: Local Planning Process................................................................. 21
Figure 2.3: The results chain of Development plan......................................... 26
Figure 3.1: Research Design........................................................................... 40
LIST OF TABLES

Table 2.1: Findings of Literature Review .................................................................30
Table 3.1: Achievement Level of Objective Criteria ................................................50
Table 4.1: Objective Achievement Matrix ................................................................53
Table 4.2: Criteria of objectives relevant to each action project .........................54
Table 4.3: Calculating (∑AiC1) and CAVj values for Town Center
   Development Project ..........................................................................................56
Table 4.4: Calculating (∑AiC1) and CAVj values for Katubadda Sub
   Town Development Project .............................................................................57
Table 4.5: Calculating (∑AiC1) and CAVj values for Lunawa Lagoon
   Development Project ........................................................................................58
Table 4.6: Calculating (∑AiC1) and CAVj values for Housing
   Development Project ........................................................................................59
Table 4.7: Calculating (∑AiC1) and CAVj values for Coastal Road
   Development Project ........................................................................................60
Table 4.8: Calculating (∑AiC1) and CAVj values for Parks Development
   Project .................................................................................................................61
Table 4.9: Calculating (∑AiC1) and CAVj values for Parks Development
   Project .................................................................................................................62
### LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Explanation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>$A_i C_j$</td>
<td>Activity vs. Criteria value</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CAV$_j$</td>
<td>Criteria Achievement Value</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>COC</td>
<td>Certificate of Conformity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LA</td>
<td>Local Authority</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MC</td>
<td>Municipal Council</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>POE</td>
<td>Plan Outcome Evaluation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UDA</td>
<td>Urban Development Authority</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>