Value Management Based IT Procurement Model for Construction Organisations



By

Karunasena G.I. Faculty of Architecture University of Moratuwa Sri Lanka January 2006

85986

Value Management Based IT Procurement Model for Construction Organisations



-72°06" -72°06"

Thesis Submitted as a Fulfillment of Master of Philosophy

Faculty of Architecture University of Moratuwa

University of Moratuwa

85986

Sri Lanka January 2006



Dedication



University of Moratuwa, Sri Lanka. Electronic Theses & Dissertations www.lib.mrt.ac.lk

To my parents with love.....

Declaration

I hereby declare that this submission is my own work and that, to the best my knowledge and belief, it contains material or facts neither previously published or written by another person nor which to a substantial extent has been accepted for award of any degree or diploma of a university or other institute of higher education, except where an acknowledgement has been made.

UOM Verified Signature

Karunasena G.I.



University of Moratuwa, Sri Lanka. Electronic Theses & Dissertations www.lib.mrt.ac.lk 31.01.2006

Date

Table of Contents

C

LI	ST OF	FIGURES	V
LI	ST OF	TABLES	VI
LI	ST OF	ABBREVIATIONS	.VII
A	CKNO	WLEDGEMENT	VIII
AI	BSTRA	\CТ	IX
1	INT	RODUCTION	1
	1.1	BACKGROUND	1
	1.2	THE PROBLEM STATEMENT	2
	1.3	AIMS OF RESEARCH	2
	1.4	OBJECTIVES	3
	1.5	METHODOLOGY	3
	1.6	SCOPE AND LIMITATIONS	4
	1.7	RESEARCH OUTPUTS/ DISSEMINATION	5
	1.8	THE STRUCTURE OF THE REPORT	5
2	VAI	LUE MANAGEMENT	7
	2.1	INTRODUCTION	7
	2.2	REASONS FOR SELECTION OF VALUE MANAGEMENT	7
	2.3	THE CONCEPTS OF VALUE MANAGEMENT	8
	2.4	OBJECTIVES OF VALUE MANAGEMENT	10
	2.5	How the Best Value is Achieved or Improved	10
	2.6	THE PHASES OF VALUE MANAGEMENT	11
	2.6.1	I Information phase	11
	2.6.2	2 Objectives phase	11
	2.6.3	3 Functional analysis phase	11
	2.6.4	4 Creativity phase	11
	2.6.5	5 Evaluation phase	11
	2.6.0	6 Development phase	11

2.6.7	Reporting and recommendation phase	
2.7 Te	CHNIQUES OF VALUE MANAGEMENT	12
2.7.1	Functional Analysis System Technique (FAST)	12
2.7.2	Brainstorming	
2.7.3	Decision making matrices / Value tree	12
2.7.4	Life cycle costing (whole life costing)	
2.7.5	Cost-benefit analysis	13
2.7.6	Cash flow	13
2.8 TH	IE APPROACHES OF VALUE MANAGEMENT	
2.8.1	The charette	13
2.8.2	The 40 hour workshop	
2.8.3	The value management audit	
2.9 Be	ENEFITS OF VALUE MANAGEMENT	14
2.10 Co	DNCLUSIONS	15
3 IT PRO	OCUREMENT	16
3.1 IN	TRODUCTION	
3.2 Re	EASONS FOR FAILURES IN IT PROCUREMENT	17
3.3 FA	ACTORS OF SUCCESSFUL IT PROCUREMENT	
3.4 Pr	iases of Traditional IT Procurement Process	
3.5 IT	PROCUREMENT METHODS	
3.5.1	Straightforward IT procurement	
3.5.1	1.1 Pure consulting services	
3.5.1	.2 Off the shelf supply and maintenance of IT products	
3.5.2	Complex IT procurement	
3.5.2	2.1 Supply and installation of information systems	20
3.5.2	2.2 System engineering or system integration contracts	
3.6 PA	AYMENT OPTIONS	21
3.6.1	Hiring, renting and leasing	
3.6.2	Risk and reward	
3.6.3	Application Service Provision (ASP)	
3.7 Co	ONCLUSIONS	21

ii

4 USE OI	F VALUE MANAGEMENT FOR IT PROCUREMENT	IN THE
CONSTRUC	TION INDUSTRY	
4.1 Inte	RODUCTION	22
4.2 Me	THODOLOGY ADOPTED AT INDUSTRIAL SURVEY	22
4.2.1	Data collection	
4.2.2	Analysis and interpretation of data	
4.3 Res	earch Outcome of Industrial Survey	24
4.3.1	Value management practices in the construction industry	
4.3.2	IT procurement in construction industry	25
4.3.2.1	Hardware procurement methods	26
4.3.2.2	Software procurement	29
4.3.2.3	Human resource procurement	
4.3.2.4	IT services procurement	
4.3.2.5	Problems associated with IT procurement	
4.3.2.0	5 Suggestions for improvement of IT procurement	35
4.3.2.7	Application of value management to IT procurement	35
4.3.3	IT procurement practices in non construction organisations	
4.4 Con	CLUSIONS Www.lib.mrt.ac.lk	
5 MODEI	FOR IT PROCUREMENT USING PRINCIPLES OF	VALUE
MANAGEM	ENT	
5.1 Int	RODUCTION	
5.2 Овј	ectives of IT Procurement Model	
5.3 Dev	/elopment Phase of IT Procurement Model	
5.3.1	Designing and evaluation of model	
5.3.2	Development of evaluated model	
5.4 Det	AILS OF MODEL DESIGNING	
5.4.1	Conceptual designing	
5.4.2	Information modeling	40
5.5 Des	SIGN EVALUATION	
5.5.1	Methodology adopted	48
5.5.2	Results of design evaluation	
5.6 Cor	VCLUSIONS	54

الله المالية المالية المستحدثة

6	DEC	ISION SUPPORT SYSTEM FOR IT PROCUREMENT	55
	6.1	INTRODUCTION	55
	6.2	OBJECTIVES OF DECISION SUPPORT SYSTEM	
	6.3	DEVELOPMENT PHASES OF DECISION SUPPORT SYSTEM	55
	6.3.1	Database development	55
	6.3.2	System interfaces	
	6.3.3	System testing	59
	6.3.4	Development tools	60
	6.4	Features of a Decision Support System	61
	6.5	System Requirements and Guidelines for Execution	61
	6.6	Expert Opinion Survey	
	6.6.1	Methodology adopted	62
	6.6.2	Results of expert opinion survey	62
	6.7	Conclusions	64
7	COI	CLUSIONS AND FURTHER DEVELOPMENTS	
	7.1	CONCLUSIONS	65
	7.2	MAIN RESULTS OF RESEARCH	66
	7.2.1	Key findings of industry survey	66
	7.2.2		
		Results of model evaluation	
	7.2.3	Key findings of expert opinion survey	
	7.2.3 7.3		
		Key findings of expert opinion survey	
	7.3	Key findings of expert opinion survey Benefits of IT Procurement Model Limitations	
	7.3 7.4	Key findings of expert opinion survey BENEFITS OF IT PROCUREMENT MODEL LIMITATIONS Limitations of research	
	7.3 7.4 <i>7.4</i> .1	Key findings of expert opinion survey BENEFITS OF IT PROCUREMENT MODEL LIMITATIONS Limitations of research	68 69 70 70 71 71
	7.3 7.4 7.4.2	Key findings of expert opinion survey BENEFITS OF IT PROCUREMENT MODEL LIMITATIONS Limitations of research Limitations of IT procurement model (DSS)	68 69 70 70 71 71 71 71
R	7.3 7.4 <i>7.4.1</i> 7.4.2 7.5 7.6	Key findings of expert opinion survey BENEFITS OF IT PROCUREMENT MODEL LIMITATIONS Limitations of research Limitations of IT procurement model (DSS) POSSIBILITIES FOR FURTHER DEVELOPMENT	

Ø

iv

List of Figures

Figure 1.1: Research methodology	4
Figure 1.2: Structure of the report	5
Figure 2.1: Generic process of value management	9
Figure 3.1: Traditional IT procurement process	
Figure 3.2: IT procurement systems	19
Figure 4.1: Factors indicating under utilization of IT	25
Figure 4.2: Hardware procurement methods	26
Figure 4.3: Factors considered for procurement of IT	27
Figure 4.4: Approaches for special purpose of software	
Figure 4.5: Procurement methods for off the shelf software	
Figure 4.6: Procurement methods for tailor made software	31
Figure 4.7: Factors considered in procurement of software	
Figure 4.8: Procurement methods for IT services	
Figure 5.1: Conceptual design for IT procurement model	
Figure 5.2: Detailed design for conceptual model	
Figure 5.3: Object oriented model for IT procurement	
Figure 5.4: Use case diagram	
Figure 5.5: Sequence diagram	
Figure 6.1: Main menu	
Figure 6.2: IT procurement requirements entry form	
Figure 6.3: Ranked list of IT procurement methods	
Figure 6.4: Reports on IT procurement methods	59

v

List of Tables

Table 4.1: Advantages of hardware procurement methods practiced	
Table 4.2: Advantages and disadvantages of software procurement methods	
Table 5.1: Summary of model	
Table 5.2: Results of case study	
Table 5.3:Summarized results of model evaluation	50
Table 5.4: Results of procurement requirements	51
Table 5.5: Procedure, merits and demerits of IT procurement methods	52
Table 6.1: Summarized information of expert opinion survey	63



University of Moratuwa, Sri Lanka. Electronic Theses & Dissertations www.lib.mrt.ac.lk

List of Abbreviations

- ASP -Application Services Provision
- DB -Database
- DSS -Decision Support System
- FAST -Functional Analysis System Technique
- HW -Hardware
- ICTAD -Institute Construction Training And Development
- IDE -Integrated Development Environment
- IESL -Institute of Engineers, Sri Lanka
- ISO -International Standard Organisation
- IT -Information Technology
- J2SDK -Java 2 Soft Development Kit
- JDK -Java Development Kit
- LAN -Local Area Network
- MM -Method Message
- MS -Microsoft

RDMS -Relational Database Management System

University of Moratuwa, Sri Lanka.

Electronic Theses & Dissertations

- SAVE -Society of American Value Engineers
- SDK -Soft Development Kit
- SPSS -Statistical Package for Social Science
- SQL -Standard Query Language
- SW -Software
- TQM -Total Quality Management
- UK -United Kingdom
- UML -Unified Modeling Language
- VA -Value Analysis
- VE -Value Engineering
- VM -Value Management
- VP -Value Planning
- WAN -Wide Area Network

Acknowledgement

It is with deep gratitude that I cherish memories of many whose efforts influenced content and direction of this research.

It has been a real pleasure to work with Dr Srinath Perera, who as supervisor gently guided and directed me through the tedious process of research. I also express my gratitude to Mr. Indunil Seneviratne for his guidance, advice and support extended towards the research.

I will be failing in my duty if I do not extend my gratitude to Archt. Lalith de Silva (former Head of Department of Building Economics, University of Moratuwa and cosupervisor) and other academic and non-academic staff members of the Department of Building Economics for their unfailing assistance rendered towards this research. My thanks also go out to Prof. Chitra Weddikara, former Research Director of Building Economics Management Research Unit (BEMRU), for numerous assistance rendered.



My special thanks are extended to Prof. Lakshman Alwis (former Director, Postgraduate Research) and Dr. Harsha Munasinghe (Director, Postgraduate Studies), Faculty of Architecture, University of Moratuwa for their guidance towards success of this research. Also I would like to express gratitude to External examiners, Prof. Allen Ashworth and Mr. H.D. Chandrasena for their valuable comments.

Many other individuals contributed in special ways to make this research a success. I greatly appreciate the input of construction and non-construction professionals in industry. Also I would like to thank Mr. Saman de Silva, Mr. Radesh Batuwita and Ms. Waruni Liyanage for their advice and support towards success of this research.

I also wish to thank all my colleagues at research unit for their unfailing support given at all times. Last but not least, I gratefully acknowledge support and encouragement of my mother, father, sister and brother.

Karunasena G.I.

Abstract

Lack of effective IT exploitation in construction organisations often create difficulty in justifying future expansion and use of benefits of IT innovations. The problem of identifying best IT products, procurement approaches, costs and benefits is one reason behind that. It is a global problem experienced at all types of business sectors and organisations. However, it is more acute in the construction industry as a result of its structure, fragmentation and under capitalization.

A recent article by Central Unit of Procurement, UK states, everybody benefits from fast, effective and transparent procurement. It reduces supplier cost, enables the organisation to fulfill commitments faster and more effectively and gives better value for the client's money. This necessitates existence of a tool to identify best-valued procurement options and provide feedback on their probable successes or failures. Therefore, the primary aim of this study is development of Decision Support System for construction organisations to assist in IT procurement capable of increasing customer satisfaction while eliminating unnecessary expenditure with value management principles. Value management is an organized approach providing necessary functions at the lowest cost.

For development of the model, theoretical considerations and current industry practices were reviewed to synthesize a new approach drawing from the best practices of procurement in construction industry. This new approach also incorporates principles of value management in selecting the best procurement route. The selection was then modeled into an Object Oriented information model allowing users to make intelligent and informed decisions on procurement routes. It was then tested with real life IT procurement scenarios and refined accordingly. The evaluated model was enhanced as a Computer Aided Decision Support tool providing a user-friendly guide for IT procurement in construction organisations. The research samples comprised of experienced academics and industry representatives, all with direct experience in IT based systems within construction organisations. The research established need for a new approach to assist IT procurement in construction organisations was discovered.

1

Ļ

The developed Decision Support Model provides an interactive and automated system for procuring IT in timely manner with the best value. The model has been designed to help users to understand procedures, merits and demerits associated with ranked list of best valued procurement methods that can be used to procure IT for identified IT solutions and IT procurement requirements. The model is targeted at the senior management level, particularly those without much knowledge in IT procurement, but responsible for such. The model is effective in satisfying established objectives and requirements of construction organisations, eliminating deficiencies in IT procurement. The main benefit expected from IT procurement model is assurance of best value, cost savings and better performance in procurement process encouraging enhanced investments in IT.

KEYWORDS: Information Technology Procurement, Value Management, Construction Industry, Procurement Model, IT Solutions, Decision Support System



University of Moratuwa, Sri Lanka. Electronic Theses & Dissertations www.lib.mrt.ac.lk