EVALUATION OF RISK MANAGEMENT FRAMEWORKS FOR HOSPITALS

Wickramasooriyage Devmini Maheshani Kularatne

(198018J)

Degree of Master of Science

Department of Civil Engineering

University of Moratuwa

Sri Lanka

June 2020

EVALUATION OF RISK MANAGEMENT FRAMEWORKS FOR HOSPITALS

Wickramasooriyage Devmini Maheshani Kularatne

(198018J)

Thesis submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree Master of Science in Civil Engineering

Department of Civil Engineering

University of Moratuwa

Sri Lanka

June 2020

Declaration

I declare that this is my own work and this thesis does not incorporate without acknowledgment any material previously submitted for a Degree or Diploma in any other University or institute of higher learning and to the best of my knowledge and belief it does not contain any material previously published or written by another person except where the acknowledgment is made in the text.

Also, I hereby grant to the University of Moratuwa the non-exclusive right to reproduce and distribute my thesis, in whole or in part in print, electronic, or other medium. I retain the right to use this content in whole or part in future works (such as articles or books).

Signature:	Date:01.05.2021
The above candidate has carried out research supervision.	for the Master's thesis under my
Name of the supervisor: Dr C.S.A. Siriwardana	
Signature of the supervisor:	Date:

Abstract

Unlike disasters that arise from natural hazards, fire disasters can occur at any moment, in any place, if the proper precautions are not taken. The spreading of fire can more often cause disastrous results, such as loss of property, injuries, and death. Hospitals especially have a vulnerability to fire, considering the flammable materials present in the buildings such as medical gas, generator fuel, laboratory materials, high fire risk areas such as kitchens and generator room, a high waste generation which occurs in hospitals as well as the vulnerable people in the hospital such as patients with mobility issues. Therefore, fire risk management is essential for hospitals.

This research study focused on developing a risk management framework for hospitals focusing on fire hazards. The framework consists of two sections; a risk assessment tool that can be used to assess the fire risk performance of hospitals and a post-disaster activity list for hospitals after a fire hazard. The framework consists of three modules: design and construction, operation and maintenance, and fire hazard management. This framework can be used by hospital administrators to evaluate the current level of fire safety of the hospital. Thereby, the administration can analyze the weaknesses and take action to correct them. The post-disaster activity list contains actions related to the elements of people, buildings and critical infrastructure, hospital equipment, and material and post-disaster administrative work.

During the development and analyzing the applicability of the risk management framework, six governmental and 3 private-owned hospitals were assessed. The data collected revealed some key differences between the two types of hospitals. The private-owned hospitals showed a better level of preparedness for hospital fires as they had fire extinguishers and other fire protection systems which were updated regularly, had annual maintenance and testing of fire protection systems and annual fire training and fire drills for staff. In almost all of the surveyed government hospitals, these elements of preparedness were missing.

Keywords: safe hospital, fire safety, risk management framework, risk assessment tool, post-disaster management

Dedication

Fire exists the first in light, - And then consolidates, -

Only the chemist can disclose - Into what carbonates

-Emily Dickinson-(1830-1886)

To my parents,

Thank you,

For dousing those physical fires, I lit in my childhood,

but also,

For kindling the fires that were my thirst for knowledge

Acknowledgments

I would like to express my heartfelt thanks to my research supervisor, Dr. Chandana

Siriwardana for his guidance, suggestions, and motivation throughout the research

study. His immense support allowed me to gain a wide exposure to the area of disaster

risk reduction in the local and international arenas. I also express my sincere gratitude

to Prof. Asoka Perera and Dr. Nimal Wijayaratna for their guidance and advice in this

study.

I would also like to thank my colleagues, Mr. Hashan Hasalanka, Ms. Ishani Shehara,

Mr. Kusal Rathnayake, Ms. Sonali Abeysinghe, and Mr. Thilanga Fonseka for their

assistance during my data collection activities and participation in peer discussions

relevant to the research study.

I also wish to thank Dr. H.B.D. Herath, Dr. A. Wedamulla and Dr. N. Wijesekara form

the Disaster Preparedness and Response Division as well as Dr. K.A.L.C.

Kodithuwakku from the Dengue Control Unit of the Ministry of Health, Sri Lanka for

facilitating access to government-owned hospitals for case studies as well as the advice

and guidance given throughout this research study.

Sincere thanks also go out to the administrative officials of the hospitals surveyed

during the study for providing access to the hospitals. I would also like to thank the

staff of each hospital for their help and cooperation during the data collection.

Finally, I would like to express my gratitude for the fire safety industry professionals,

disaster management professionals and the medical professionals who helped during

the course of the study.

Thank you,

Devmini Kularatne

vi

Table of Contents

Decla	ration		. iii
Abstr	act		. iv
Dedic	cation .		v
Ackno	owledg	gments	. vi
Table	of Co	ntents	vii
List o	f Figu	res	xii
List o	f Table	es	xvi
List o	f Abbı	reviationsxv	viii
1 I	Introdu	ction to the Research Study	1
1.1	Ba	ckground	1
1.2	Th	esis Question	4
1.3	Pro	oblem Statement	5
1.4	Sco	ope of the Study	5
1.5	Re	search Objectives	5
1.6	Ou	tcomes	6
2 I	Literatı	ıre Review	7
2.1	Dis	saster Risk Terminology	7
2	2.1.1	Hazard	7
2	2.1.2	Disaster	7
2	2.1.3	Exposure	7
2	2.1.4	Preparedness	7
2	2.1.5	Capacity	
	2.1.6	Vulnerability	
	2.1.7	Risk	8

	2.1.8	Disaster Resilience	8
	2.1.9	Safe Hospital	8
2.:	2 Dis	saster Profile in Sri Lanka	8
2.:	3 Fire	e	10
	2.3.1	Introduction to Fire	10
	2.3.2	Negative Effects of Fire	11
	2.3.3	Economic Losses of Fire Hazards	18
2.	4 He	althcare Institutions in Sri Lanka	20
2.:	5 Dis	saster Risk in Hospitals	22
2.	6 Fire	e Hazards in Hospitals	23
	2.6.1	Risk of Fires in Hospitals	23
	2.6.2	Causes of Fire in Hospitals	24
	2.6.3	Past Studies of Fire Safety in Hospitals in Sri Lanka	33
2.	7 Dis	saster Risk Management	35
	2.7.1	Introduction to Risk Management Processes	36
	2.7.2	Plan Risk Management	36
	2.7.3	Identifying Risks	37
	2.7.4	Perform Risk Analysis	37
	2.7.5	Plan Risk Responses	38
	2.7.6	Control Risks	39
2.	8 Fra	meworks, Regulations, and Codes	39
	2.8.1	Disaster Risk Reduction Frameworks	39
	2.8.2	Disaster Risk Reduction for Hospitals	40
	2.8.3	Building Regulations and Codes related to Fire Safety	41
	2.8.4	Post-Disaster Management Frameworks	44
2.1	9 Cvo	cle of Fire Safety	47

	2.10	F	Fire Safety Components	48
	2.1	0.1	Fire Safety Systems	48
	2.1	0.2	Building Components for Fire Safety	55
	2.1	0.3	Fire Insurance	57
	2.1	0.4	Fire Safety Training	57
	2.1	0.5	Notices and Signs	60
	2.1	0.6	Economics of Fire Safety	62
	2.11	I	nvolvement of the Fire Service Department	62
	2.1	1.1	Contribution from the Fire Service Department	62
	2.1	1.2	Fire Service Department in Sri Lanka	63
	2.1	1.3	Travel from a Fire Service Department to the Location of a Fire	65
3	Res	searc	ch Methodology	66
	3.1	Intı	oduction	66
	3.2	Me	thodology Flow Chart	66
4	De	velo	pment of Fire Risk Management Framework Structure	67
5	Stu	dy c	of Travel from Fire Brigades to Hospitals	70
	5.1	Intı	oduction	70
	5.2	Me	thodology	70
	5.3	Res	sults	72
6	Init	tial (Case Studies in Hospitals	75
	6.1	Intı	oduction	75
	6.2	Me	thodology	75
	6.3	Cri	teria of the assessment form	76
	6.4	Dat	ta Collection	78
	6.5	Res	sults	80
7	Fire	e Ris	sk Assessment Tool for Hospitals	. 84

	7.1	Dev	velopment of the FRAT	84
	7.1	.1	Design and Construction	89
	7.1	.2	Operation and Maintenance	. 94
	7.1	.3	Fire Hazard Management	101
	7.2	App	olication of the FRAT	105
	7.2	.1	Application in Private-Owned Hospitals	106
	7.2	.2	Application in Government-Owned Hospitals	113
	7.2	.3	Comparison of the Assessment Results between Privately-Owned	and
	Go	verni	ment-Owned Hospitals	119
	7.3	App	plicability of the FRAT	121
8	Su	rvey	on Preparedness of Staff of Privately-Owned Hospitals in the Event	of a
Fi	re 122	2		
	8.1	Intr	oduction	122
	8.2	Met	thodology	122
	8.2	.1	Structure of the Survey	122
	8.2	.2	Choosing the Sample Set	122
	8.3	Der	mography of the Responders	123
	8.4	Res	ults of the Questionnaire	126
9	De	velop	oment of the Post-Disaster Activity List	129
	9.1	Stru	acture of the Activity List	129
	9.2	Cor	mpilation of Post-Disaster Activities	129
	9.2	.1	People	130
	9.2	.2	Buildings and Critical Infrastructure Systems	131
	9.2	.3	Hospital Equipment	132
	9.2	.4	Hospital Material Stores	132
	9.2	.5	Post-Fire Managerial and Administrative Work	133

9.3	Summarization of the Proposed Activity List	134
9.4	Validation of the Activity List	140
9.4	4.1 Method of Validation	140
9.4	4.2 Reliability of the Data	141
9.4	4.3 Results of Validation Process	141
9.4	4.4 Discussion	144
10 Co	onclusions and Recommendations	146
10.1	Concluding Remarks	146
10.2	Recommendations	148
10.3	Future Work	150
11 Re	eference List	151
Append	dix I : Assessment of Hospital A	164
Append	dix II : Assessment of Hospital B	171
Append	dix III : Assessment of Hospital C	178
Append	dix IV : Assessment of DH Q	185
Append	dix V : Assessment of BH U	192
Append	dix VI : Assessment of DGH S	199
Append	dix VII : Questionnaire Form for Hospital Staff	206
	dix VIII : Conference Paper, Moratuwa Engineering Research Conferen	-
2019		211
	dix IX : Conference Paper, International Conference on Structural Engonstruction Management, December 2019	_
	dix X : Conference Paper, International Conference on Sustainab	
	nment, December 2020	
THAILOI	initent, December 2020	230

List of Figures

Figure 1: Number of disasters in 2017 by continent and top countries	2
Figure 2: Occurrence by disaster type: 2017 compared to 2007-2016	2
Figure 3: Number of deaths by disaster type: 2017 compared to 2007-2016	3
Figure 4: Selection of fire hazards	4
Figure 5: Number of records of disasters in Sri Lanka (2008 January – 2020 Apri	1).9
Figure 6: Fire Tetrahedron	10
Figure 7: Phases in the development of a fire	11
Figure 8: Breakdown of fire-related losses	12
Figure 9: Gases in smoke	13
Figure 10: Fire incidents in Sri Lanka (2009-2019)	15
Figure 11: Deaths due to fire incidents in Sri Lanka (2009-2019)	15
Figure 12: Houses destroyed due to fire incidents in Sri Lanka (2009-2019)	16
Figure 13: Houses damaged due to fire incidents in Sri Lanka (2009-2019)	17
Figure 14: Reported statistics of fire hazards	18
Figure 15: Different types of hospital types in Sri Lanka	20
Figure 16: Causes of fire in healthcare facilities in the USA	25
Figure 17: Causes of fires in Dutch healthcare institutions (2004-2013)	25
Figure 18: Countrywise distribution of the sample set	30
Figure 19: Time distribution of the sample set	31
Figure 20: Distribution of cause of fire in sample set	31
Figure 21: Process of planning risk responses	38
Figure 22: Cycle of fire safety	47
Figure 23: Manual call point	51
Figure 24: Smoke detector	51
Figure 25: Heat detector	51
Figure 26: Fire alarm sounder	51
Figure 27: Sprinkler head	53
Figure 28: Water hose reel	54
Figure 29: External fire hydrant	55
Figure 30: Diagram of a fire door	56

Figure 31: An example of a smoke-stop lobby	57
Figure 32: Influence of trained staff during evacuation	59
Figure 33: Fire action notice	61
Figure 34: Fire door notice	61
Figure 35: Emergency fire exit sign.	61
Figure 36: Fire extinguisher instruction notice	62
Figure 37: Hierarchy of officials in fire service department in Sri Lanka	64
Figure 38: Fire stations in Sri Lanka	64
Figure 39: Fire stations in Colombo district	65
Figure 40: Research methodology flow chart	66
Figure 41: Structure of risk considering fire hazards	67
Figure 42: FRMF Structure	69
Figure 43: Path of Colombo Fire Service Department to NH Sri Lanka	71
Figure 44: Path of Gampaha Fire Service Department to DGH Gampaha	71
Figure 45: Path of Dehiwala Fire Service Department to TH Kalubowila	72
Figure 46: Path of Mawanella Fire Service Department to TH Kegalle	72
Figure 47: Average speed variations across the 24-hour time period	73
Figure 48: BH P - Manifold room in safe conditions	78
Figure 49: BH P - Abandoned incinerator in unsafe conditions	78
Figure 50: BH P - Improper waste management	78
Figure 51: DGH S - Systematic storage of waste until collection	78
Figure 52: DGH S - Electrical wiring in unsafe conditions	79
Figure 53: DH Q - Flammable materials stored next to kitchen gas	79
Figure 54: DGH S - Emergency evacuation notices in the buildings	79
Figure 55: BH U - Safe storage of medical gas	79
Figure 56: Fire safety preparedness of hospitals surveyed	83
Figure 57: Cross-section of hospital staff involved in FHM discussion	105
Figure 58: Assessment result summary of Hospital A	106
Figure 59: Assessment result summary of Hospital B	107
Figure 60: Assessment result summary of Hospital C	108
Figure 61: Assessment result summary of DH Q	113
Figure 62: Assessment result summary of BH U	114

Figure 63: Assessment result summary of DGH S
Figure 64: Job position distribution of responders
Figure 65: Gender distribution of responders
Figure 66: Age distribution of responders
Figure 67: Number of years responders had worked in the current hospital 125
Figure 68: Fire safety related training of responders
Figure 69: Self-evaluation of responders regarding their preparedness
Figure 70: Variation of the impact of fire with time
Figure 71: Activity categorization according to the impact of fire on people 137
Figure 72: Activity sequence for material stores in the fire-affected area
Figure 73: Activity sequence for buildings and critical infrastructure in the fire-
affected area
Figure 74: Activity sequence for equipment in the fire-affected area
Figure 75: Fields of expertise of the experts
Figure 76: Level of agreement for post-disaster activities for people142
Figure 77: Level of agreement for post-disaster activities for buildings and critical
infrastructure
Figure 78: Level of agreement for post-disaster activities for hospital equipment . 143
Figure 79: Level of agreement for post-disaster activities for hospital materials 143
Figure 80: Level of agreement for post-disaster activities for post-disaster
administrative and managerial work
Figure 81: Hospital A -Design and construction assessment
Figure 82: Hospital A - Operation and maintenance assessment
Figure 83: Hospital A - Fire hazard management assessment
Figure 84: Hospital B - Design and construction assessment
Figure 85: Hospital B - Operation and maintenance assesment
Figure 86: Hospital B – Fire hazard management assessment
Figure 87: Hospital C - Design and construction assessment
Figure 88: Hospital C – Operation and maintenance assessment
Figure 89: Hospital C - Fire hazard management assessment
Figure 90: DH Q - Design and construction assessment
Figure 91: DH Q - Operation and maintenance assessment

Figure 92: DH Q - Fire hazard management assessment	191
Figure 93:BH U - Design and construction assessment	193
Figure 94: BH U - Operation and maintenance assessment	196
Figure 95: BH U - Fire hazard management assessment	198
Figure 96: DGH S – Design and construction assessment	200
Figure 97: DGH S - Operation and maintenance assessment	203
Figure 98: DGH SFire hazard management assessment	205

List of Tables

Table 1: Types of government hospitals in Sri Lanka and the units in them
Table 2: Details of hospital fires in the sample
Table 3: Tabulation of causes of fire countrywise
Table 4: Results of fire safety performance by Gunathilaka (2018)
Table 5: Assessment of fire protection systems using HSI guide
Table 6: Maximum coverage area of and spacing between sprinkler heads 53
Table 7: Choosing fire extinguisher type
Table 8: Travel time data from fire service departments to hospitals73
Table 9: Distance between the hospitals and their nearest fire service station 80
Table 10: Assessment results of hospitals surveyed
Table 11: FRAT Module - DC, Submodule - Means of escape
Table 12: FRAT Module - DC, Submodule - Fire hazard prevention
Table 13: FRAT Module - DC, Submodule - Accessibility to the fire brigade 93
Table 14: FRAT Module – OM, Submodule - Means of escape
Table 15: FRAT Module – OM, Submodule - Fire detection and alarm systems 96
Table 16: FRAT Module – OM, Submodule - Active fire protection systems 97
Table 17: FRAT Module – OM, Submodule Fire hazard prevention
Table 18: FRAT Module – OM, Submodule - Firefighting
Table 19: FRAT Module – FHM, Submodule - Disaster planning 101
Table 20: FRAT Module – FHM, Submodule - Staff training
Table 21: FRAT Module-FHM, Submodule-Inspection, maintenance, and testing 104
Table 22: Post-disaster activities to be conducted in a hospital after a fire 134
Table 23: Results obtained from IBM SPSS 26 software
Table 24: Hospital A - Design and construction assessment
Table 25: Hospital A – Operation and maintenance assessment
Table 26: Hospital A - Fire hazard management assessment
Table 27: Hospital B - Design and construction assessment
Table 28: Hospital B - Operation and maintenance assesment
Table 29: Hospital B – Fire hazard management assessment
Table 30: Hospital C - Design and construction assessment

Table 31: Hospital C – Operation and maintenance assessment	180
Table 32: Hospital C - Fire hazard management assessment	183
Table 33: DH Q - Design and construction assessment	185
Table 34: DH Q - Operation and maintenance assessment	187
Table 35: DH Q - Fire hazard management assessment	190
Table 36: BH U - Desgin and construction assesment	192
Table 37: BH U - Operation and maintenance assessment	194
Table 38: BH U - Fire hazard management assessment	197
Table 39: DGH Matara - Design and construction assessment	199
Table 40: DGH S - Operation and maintenance assessment	201
Table 41: DGH S - Fire hazard management assessment	204

List of Abbreviations

BBB Build Back Better

BH Base Hospital

DC Design and Construction

DGH District General Hospital

DH Divisional Hospital

DRP Disaster Recovery Plan

DRR Disaster Risk Reduction

EEP Emergency Evacuation Procedures

ERT Emergency Response Team

FAP Fire Action Plan

FC Fire Commander

FEMA Federal Emergency Management Agency

FHM Fire Hazard Management

FRAT Fire Risk Assessment Tool

FRMF Fire Risk Management Framework

FRS Fire and Rescue Services

FSC Fire and Safety Check

GDP Gross Domestic Product

HDMP Hospital Disaster Management Plan

HSI Hospital Safety Index

IRS Incident Reporting System

NGDP National Gross Domestic Product

NH National Hospital

OM Operation and Maintenance

PMCU Primary Medical Care Unit

TH Teaching Hospital

UNISDR United Nations International Strategy for Disaster Reduction