

**AN ANALYSIS OF DISPUTES RELATED TO
EARTH RETAINING STRUCTURE CONSTRUCTION
PROJECTS IN SRI LANKA**

Surendar Selvarajha

(159172U)

Thesis submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirement for the degree of
Master of Science in Construction Law & Dispute Resolution

Department of Building Economics

University of Moratuwa

Sri Lanka

January 2019

DECLARATION

I formally declare all of this to be my own work and, as far as I know, and believe it is, it does not contain previously written or written graduate material or diploma material, except if it had been recognized in the text. This is not unconsented.

I shall also grant the completely non - exclusive right to reproduce my dissertation / thesis in print, electronically or another medium, in whole or in part, to the University of Moratuwa.

.....
S. Surendar

.....
Date

I hereby acknowledge that Mr.S.Surendar has followed the dissertation process set by the Department of Building Economics.

.....
Dr. (Mrs.) Chandanie Hadiwattege
Dissertation Supervisor

.....
Date

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

I would like first and foremost to thank all those who contributed to the study. I have to thank Dr. Chandanie Hadiwattege for her great patience and attention in guiding me, providing guidance and encouragement in those difficult times in which to complete this research. I am deeply committed to this.

Furthermore, I really want to thank all the people in the case study involved in the projects, who have helped me directly to make academic research possible, including all institutions, construction firms, and consulting firms. Especially thanks go to the National Building Research Origination (NBRO) construction professionals.

Finally, I wanted to say thank my wife, Mrs. Gayathri Surendar who, in this difficult season, has persevered in true love and calmness, patience and all difficulty takes care of the family, and my appreciation goes to my parents for the moral and emotional support they have given me during the course of my studies.

ABSTRACT

An Analysis of Disputes related to Earth Retaining Structure Construction Projects in Sri Lanka

In last two decades, here the technical and economic circumstances prevailing in the construction industry have changed dramatically to take precedence over the shortcomings of project disputes concerning Earth retaining structures (ERS), such as technical disputes and procurement. Different ERS construction methods are available in the construction industry, recently populated is soil nailing construction, in parallel procurement approaches have arisen with the improvement of most of the construction industry to suit various projects, having their own set of assumptions for each strategy.

Here the primary purpose of this research is to study an analysis of disputes related to earth retaining structure construction projects in Sri Lanka. Accordingly, the study discovered that factors initiating conflicts in ERS construction are in numerous forms. So these concern the nature or characteristics of contracts in which contracts or agreements are also ambiguous and unclear, allowing contracting parties to conduct themselves as opportunistic when postal changes are necessary. Factors related to role functions exist when the parties are not performing according to expectations. This study shows that some project participants ' contractual failure and subsequent post - contract adjustments as well as unscrupulous behavior are the root causes of soil nailing projects.

The study also found that, adequate mechanism for dealing with disputes in the standard contractual forms appeared in design and construction (D&B) and traditional procurement arrangements and where the provisions contradict the specific interests of the parties, the major party chose the friendly and amicable approaches to the resolution. Design and Build (D&B) procurement arrangements are better at resolving disputes, the availability of methodologies for dispute management in standard forms of contracts, the research study recommends as a strategy the framework that can decrease the conflicts occurrence in soil nailing projects.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Declaration	i
Acknowledgment	ii
Abstract	iii
Table of Contents	iv-vi
List of Table	vii
List of figures	viii
List of Acronyms	ix
Chapter 1: Introduction	01-04
1.1 Introduction	01-02
1.2 Problem Statement	02
1.3 Aim	03
1.4 Objective	03
1.5 Methodology	03
1.6 Scope and Limitations	03
1.7 Thesis Structure	04
Chapter 2: Literature Review	05-23
2.0 Earth Retaining Structure Construction	05-23
2.1 Earth Retaining Structure	05-07
2.2 Nature and the Development of the Soil Nailing Technique	07
2.2.1 The construction procedure	07-09
2.2.2 Applications of Soil Nail Walls	09-12
2.2.2.1 Roadway Cuts	10
2.2.2.2 Road Widening Under Existing Bridge Abutments	10-11
2.2.2.3 Tunnel portals	11-12
2.2.2.4 Repair and Reconstruction of Existing R.S	12
2.2.2.5 Hybrid Soil Nail Walls	12

2.2.3 Benefits of soil nailing	13-14
2.2.4 Failure modes of soil nailing	14-17
2.3 Dispute in ESR	17-21
2.3.1 Disputes in construction industry	17-21
2.4 Dispute Avoidance and Resolution	21-22
2.5 Dispute under different procurement system	23
2.5.1 Dispute in Traditional Procurement method	23
2.5.2 Dispute in design and build procurement method	23
Chapter 3: Research Methodology	24-27
3.0 Research Methodology	24-25
3.1 Research Approach	25-26
3.2 Research design	26
3.3 Data Collection and Analysis	27
Chapter 4: Data analysis and Discussion of findings	28-64
4.0 Introduction	28
4.1 Data Collection and Analysis	28-29
4.2 Case Introduction	30-34
4.3 Core Data Analysis	34-62
4.3.1 Dispute related to ERS and methods of resolutions	34-48
4.3.1.1 Within Case Analysis (Case Study-C ₁)	34-39
4.3.1.2 Within Case Analysis (Case Study-C ₂)	40-43
4.3.1.3 Within Case Analysis (Case Study-C ₃)	43-46
4.3.1.4 Within Case Analysis (Case Study-C ₄)	46-48
4.3.2 Cross Case Analysis	48-54
4.3.3 Provisions for condition of contract to handling the disputes	54-61
4.3.3.1 Disputes and Resolution Methods	62
4.4 Discussion	63-64

Chapter 5: Conclusion and Recommendation	65-70
5.0 Introduction	65
5.1 Conclusion	65-68
5.1.1 ERS Construction	65-66
5.1.2 Dispute in ERS construction	66-67
5.1.3 Dispute resolution approaches related to soil nailing construction	67-68
5.2 Recommendations	68-69
5.3 Specific contribution to knowledge achieved by the study	70
References	71-74
Appendices	75-81

LIST OF TABLES

Table 2.1 – Common causes of disputes by categories	20
Table 4.1 – Number of persons interviewed	29
Table 4.2 – Case study code system	29
Table 4.3 – Schedule of some payments delays to the Contractor	36
Table 4.4 – Schedule of EOT events (C ₁)	37
Table 4.5 – EOT event mutual negotiation settlement (C ₁)	38
Table 4.6 – Schedule of EOT events (C ₂)	42
Table 4.7 – EOT event mutual negotiation settlement (C ₂)	43
Table 4.8 – Schedule of EOT events (C ₃)	45
Table 4.9 – EOT event mutual negotiation settlement (C ₃)	46
Table 4.10 – Schedule of EOT events (C ₄)	47
Table 4.11 – EOT event mutual negotiation settlement (C ₄)	48
Table 4.12 – Summary of cross case analysis	51
Table 4.13 – Summary of empirical investigation from questionnaire survey for design and build procurement method	52
Table 4.14 – Summary of empirical investigation from questionnaire survey for traditional procurement method	53
Table 4.15 – Provisions for condition of contract (C1-DB Project)	54-57
Table 4.16 – Provisions for condition of contract (C2, C3, C4 – TM)	58-61
Table 4.17 – Disputes and resolution methods	62

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 2.1 – Typical soil nailed wall construction.	08
Figure 2.2 – Roadway cut supported with soil nails	10
Figure 2.3 – Road widening under existing bridge.	11
Figure 2.4 – Hybrid soil nail/MSE wall.	13
Figure 2.5 – Different types of failure.	14
Figure 2.6 – External failure modes.	15
Figure 2.7 – External potential failure surface.	15
Figure 2.8 – Internal failure modes.	16
Figure 2.9 – Facing failure modes.	17
Figure 2.10 – Concepts and Causal linkage of conflicts and disputes.	19
Figure 3.1 – Research methodology flowchart	24
Figure 3.2 – Nested Research Methodology.	25
Figure 3.3 – Case Study Method (Yin, 2003)	26
Figure 3.4 – The data collection and analysis procedures	27

LIST OF ACRONYMS

ERS	–	Earth Retaining Structures
ERSC	–	Earth Retaining Structures Construction
MSE	–	Mechanically Stabilized Earth
BOQ	–	Bills of Quantities
DB	–	Design and Build
TR	–	Traditional Method
CL	–	Consultant
CT	–	Contractor
NBRO	–	National Building Research Origination
DRB	–	Dispute Resolution Boards
ROW	–	Right-Of-Way
PSPs	–	Procurement Selection Parameters
EOT	–	Extension of Time
WWM	–	Welded-Wire Mesh